Role of reductase and aromatase in sex determination in the red-eared slider (Trachemys scripta), a turtle with temperature-dependent sex determination

D Crews and J M Bergeron

Institute of Reproductive Biology, Department of Zoology, University of Texas at Austin, Austin, Texas 78712, USA

Abstract

In many turtles the temperature during the middle of incubation determines the gonadal sex of the hatching. In the red-eared slider turtle (Trachemys scripta), an incubation temperature of 26 °C results in all male offspring, whereas an incubation temperature of 31 °C results in all female offspring; at temperatures intermediate to these (e.g. 29, 29.2, 29.4 °C) a mixed sex ratio is obtained. Administration of exogenous oestrogens will overcome the effects of an all-male producing incubation temperature to cause female sex determination, whereas administration of exogenous dihydrotestosterone (DHT) or testosterone to eggs incubating at an all-female temperature will have no discernible effect. Administration of DHT will cause male sex determination only if administered at intermediate incubation temperatures whereas administration of testosterone to eggs incubating at all male-producing and male-biased intermediate temperatures results in a significant number of female offspring, an effect presumably due to aromatization of testosterone to oestradiol (OE2). Since testosterone serves as the precursor to both DHT and OE2, being metabolized by reductase and aromatase respectively, three experiments were conducted to determine whether various putative reductase and aromatase inhibitors would overcome the effect of incubation temperature. First, while administration of testosterone to eggs incubating at all male-producing and male-biased intermediate temperatures produced females in a dose- and temperature-dependent manner, significant numbers of intersex individuals resulted from high dosage testosterone treatment to eggs incubating at a female-biased intermediate temperature. The reductase inhibitors 4MA and MK906 were capable of producing female offspring if administered at intermediate temperatures, but not in a dose-dependent fashion. Administration of the aromatase inhibitors CGS16949A and CGS20267 resulted in male offspring at both female-biased intermediate and at all female-producing temperatures in a dose-dependent fashion. Second, similar findings were obtained with combined doses of testosterone and reductase or aromatase inhibitors. Combined treatment of eggs at male-biased intermediate incubation temperatures with testosterone and reductase inhibitor resulted in female hatchlings, whereas combined treatment of testosterone and aromatase inhibitor at both female-biased intermediate and at all female-producing temperatures resulted in male hatchlings. Finally, treatment with reductase inhibitor and aromatase inhibitor combined resulted in only male offspring at all incubation temperatures with the exception of the all-female incubation temperature; in the latter instance almost all offspring were female. These studies indicate that in the red-eared slider turtle (i) male and female sex determination are independent cascades residing equally in each individual and regulated by incubation temperature, (ii) steroid hormones are involved in temperature-dependent sex determination, and (iii) testosterone plays a pivotal role in this process. The data also suggest that aromatase and oestrogen receptors may be involved in the initiation of an ovary determining cascade and that reductase and androgen receptors may be involved in the initiation of a testis determining cascade.

Journal of Endocrinology (1994) 143, 279–289

Introduction

Temperature-dependent sex determination (TSD) is well established in many reptiles. Depending upon the species, reptiles with TSD may exhibit one of several different patterns: low incubation temperatures producing males, high incubation temperatures producing females, and intermediate incubation temperatures producing males with females being produced at both extremes (Bull 1980). Hormonal involvement in sex determination has been demonstrated in all three reptilian orders (reviewed by Raynaud & Pieau 1985, Janzen & Paukstis 1991, Crews et al. 1994, Pieau et al. 1994, Wibbels et al. 1994), including the red-eared slider turtle (Trachemys scripta)
(Crews et al. 1991, Wibben et al. 1992, Wibben & Crews 1992). For example, treatment of eggs with exogenous oestrogen will overcome the effects of a male-producing incubation temperature to result in female hatchlings in representatives of all three reptile orders demonstrating TSD (Bull et al. 1988). Furthermore, in the European pond turtle (Emys orbicularis) administration of tamoxifen, an oestrogen receptor (ER) antagonist, to eggs incubating at a female-producing incubation temperature results in intersexes; simultaneous administration of tamoxifen and oestradiol (OE2) to eggs incubating at a male-producing incubation temperature blocks oestrogen-induced female development (Dorizzi et al. 1991). However, there may be important species differences as tamoxifen administered to eggs incubating at a female-producing incubation temperature failed to disrupt normal female development in the red-eared slider (Wibben & Crews 1992) and in the American alligator (Alligator mississippiensis; Lance & Bogart 1991).

Unlike oestrogens, androgens are not capable of overcoming an incubation temperature that produces only females. If administered to eggs incubated at a female-producing temperature, neither testosterone or dihydrotestosterone (DHT) have any discernible effect on gonadal sex (Gutcke & Bull 1986, Crews et al. 1989). Administration of testosterone, but not DHT, to eggs incubated at an all male-producing incubation temperature results in approximately half of the hatchlings being female; this ‘paradoxical’ feminization may be the result of conversion of testosterone to OE2 by the enzyme aromatase (Gutcke & Bull 1986, Crews et al. 1989, Wibben & Crews 1992). Only when utilizing incubation regimens which result in mixed sex ratios is a sensitivity to exogenous androgen revealed; under these conditions exogenous DHT will result in male offspring (Wibben et al. 1992, Wibben & Crews 1993).

Steroidogenic enzymes are influenced by incubation temperature in turtles with TSD. Pieau (1973, 1974) demonstrated 3ß-hydroxysteroid dehydrogenase (HSDH) activity in the undifferentiated gonads of the European pond turtle. Merchant-Larios et al. (1989) detected significant 3ß-HSDH activity in the adrenals, but not in the undifferentiated gonad of the Olive Ridley sea turtle (Lepidochelys olivacea). Similar results were reported for 3α-, 3ß-, and 17ß-HSDH in the red-eared slider (Thomas et al. 1992). Aromatase enzyme levels increase at the end of the temperature-sensitive window in embryos of the European pond turtle incubating at female-producing incubation temperatures, but not in embryos incubating at a male-producing incubation temperature (Desvages & Pieau 1992a). This increase does not appear to be due to temperature modulation of aromatase activity, but rather to a temperature-induced increase in aromatase production. Shifting eggs from a male-producing to a female-producing incubation temperature greatly increases aromatase activity, but a complementary shift from a female-producing to a male-producing incubation temperature only gradually decreases aromatase activity (Desvages & Pieau 1992b; see also Desvages et al. 1993).

The demonstration that exogenous androgens and oestrogens can determine sex in the red-eared slider turtle, and the fact that reductase and aromatase are key regulatory enzymes in the production of DHT and OE2, respectively, from the precursor testosterone, suggests that these enzymes may play a pivotal role in TSD. The present investigation explores this possibility in the red-eared slider turtle. In addition to the suggestion of Dorizzi et al. (1991) that aromatase is involved in determination of females, our hypothesis includes a model in which regulation of reductase gene(s) may be critical to a testis-determining cascade. Because testosterone serves as the precursor to both DHT and OE2 via the actions of the enzymes reductase and aromatase, respectively, we hypothesize that incubation temperature acts by modifying the metabolism of testosterone. In the first series of experiments chemicals known to be reductase or aromatase inhibitors in mammalian and avian systems were administered to eggs incubating at different temperatures. The second series of experiments examined the effects of simultaneous administration of testosterone and these putative enzyme inhibitors at different incubation temperatures. In the final series of experiments the effect of combined dosages of these putative reductase and aromatase inhibitors on sex determination was examined at different incubation temperatures. The results indicate (i) that TSD can be reversed by the administration of either reductase or aromatase inhibitors and that the inhibitors probably act on the enzymes themselves, rather than through the steroid receptors, (ii) that the feminizing effect of testosterone when administered to eggs incubating at a male-producing temperature is due to the aromatization of testosterone to OE2, and (iii) that the action of aromatase is more potent than that of reductase in TSD.

Materials and Methods

Eggs and incubation

Approximately 4000 freshly-laid eggs were obtained commercially (Robert Kliebert, Hammond, LA, USA). After transport to our laboratory, eggs were held at room temperature until viability was established by candling. They were then placed in containers with moistened vermiculite (vermiculite:water, 1:1) and the containers placed in reach-in incubators (Precision, Chicago, IL, USA) programmed to provide a constant temperature of 26, 29, 29-2, 29-4, or 31 °C. Previous studies with this species indicate that a continuous incubation temperature of 26 °C produces all male hatchlings whereas an incubation temperature of 31 °C produces all female hatchlings. Temperatures intermediate to these result in different sex ratios of gonadal males and females rather
TABLE 1. Experimental protocol utilized in experiment one. Eggs from the red-eared slider turtle (Trachemys scripta) were incubated at one of five incubation temperatures (26–31 °C) and treated with reductase inhibitor (4MA or MK906) or aromatase inhibitor (CGS16949A or CGS20267) at stage 17, the midpoint in the temperature-sensitive window. Controls consisted of administration of ethanol vehicle only.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chemical</th>
<th>Putative action</th>
<th>Dose (µg)</th>
<th>26 °C</th>
<th>29-0 °C</th>
<th>29-2 °C</th>
<th>29-4 °C</th>
<th>31 °C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4MA</td>
<td>Reductase</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MK906</td>
<td>Reductase</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGS16949A</td>
<td>Aromatase</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGS20267</td>
<td>Aromatase</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

than in intersex individuals: 29 °C is a male-biased incubation temperature, 29-2 °C is the threshold temperature typically producing equal numbers of males and females, and 29-4 °C is a female-biased incubation temperature (Crews et al. 1991, 1994, Wibbels et al. 1991a, Wibbels & Crews 1993). After receiving treatments, all eggs were returned to their respective incubators until they hatched.

Embryonic development was monitored by candling eggs and by dissecting 2–4 eggs approximately twice a week to verify specific developmental stages, based on criteria described by Yntema (1968). All eggs were incubated until stage 17, the approximate midpoint in the temperature-sensitive period in this species (Wibbels et al. 1991a). Eggs were then randomized into control and experimental treatments.

Enzyme inhibitors

Three series of experiments were conducted. In all experiments, eggs in control groups at each incubation temperature received a single treatment consisting of 5 µl 95% ethanol; inhibitor and/or ligand was also dissolved in 5 µl 95% ethanol.

In the first experiment, eggs in the experimental groups received a single treatment of a specific enzyme inhibitor (Table 1). Two reductase inhibitors, 17β-(N,N-diethyl) carbomoyl-4-methyl-4-aza-5α-androstane-3-one (4MA) and 17β-(N-t-butyl) carbomoyl-4-aza-5α-androst-1-en-3-one (MK906), were used; both compounds inhibit 5α-reductase (Russell & Wilson 1994). Two aromatase inhibitors, 4-(5,6,7,8-tetrahydroimidazo[1,5-a]pyridin-5-yl) benzonitrile monohydrochloride (CGS16949A) and 4-(1-(cyanophenyl)-1-(1,2,4-triazolyl) methyl) benzonitrile (CGS20267) were used; both compounds are effective in a variety of mammalian and avian species (Steele et al. 1987, Santen et al. 1990, Benoit et al. 1992, Bonsall et al. 1992, Elbrecht & Smith 1992, Wozniak et al. 1992, Wozniak & Hutchison 1993). The doses of reductase inhibitors were 0-1, 1-0, 10, or 100 µg/egg for 4MA and 1-0, 10, or 100 µg/egg for MK906. The doses for both aromatase inhibitors were 0-1, 1-0, 10, or 100 µg/egg. Mean sample sizes were as follows. 4MA: 26 individuals, ranging from 22–30, and totalling 642 animals. MK906: 26 individuals, ranging from 22–29, and totalling 529 animals. CGS16949A: 25 individuals, ranging from 21–28 and totalling 623 animals. CGS20267: 26 individuals, ranging from 21–30, and totalling 638 animals.

In the second experiment, eggs in the experimental groups received combined treatments of testosterone and an enzyme inhibitor (Table 2). To determine the effect of testosterone plus reductase inhibitor, eggs were incubated at all five temperatures and each received 100 µg testosterone and 50 µg 4MA, or 75 µg testosterone and 50 µg MK906. As treatment controls some eggs received testosterone alone. Thus, other eggs received 50 or 100 µg of testosterone (Sigma Chemical Co., St Louis, MO, USA). In addition, the sex ratio resulting from the administration of high doses of inhibitor alone was used as a comparison with that resulting from the application of precursor and inhibitor in combination.
TABLE 2. Experimental protocol utilized in experiments two and three. Eggs from the red-eared slider turtle (Trachemys scripta) were incubated at one of five incubation temperatures (26–31 °C) and received a combined treatment of testosterone (T) and reductase inhibitor (RI; 4MA or MK906) or aromatase inhibitor (AI; CGS16949A or CGS20267). Controls consisted of administration of ethanol vehicle alone or T alone.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chemical</th>
<th>Dose (μg)</th>
<th>26 °C</th>
<th>29.0 °C</th>
<th>29.2 °C</th>
<th>29.4 °C</th>
<th>31 °C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>100-0</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50-0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100-0</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI+T</td>
<td>50-0 4MA+100-0 T</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50-0 MK906+75-0 T</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al+T</td>
<td>100-0 CGS16949A+100-0 T</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100-0 CGS16949A+100-0 T</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100-0 CGS20267+100-0 T</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100-0 CGS20267+100-0 T</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiment 3</td>
<td>RI+Al 50-0 4MA+50-0 CGS16949A</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50-0 MK906+50-0 CGS16949A</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To determine the effect of testosterone plus aromatase inhibitor, eggs were also incubated at all five temperatures and each received 10 or 100 μg testosterone with 100 μg CGS16949A or CGS20267. As treatment controls some eggs received testosterone alone. Thus, other eggs received 10 or 100 μg testosterone. In addition, the sex ratio resulting from the administration of high doses of inhibitor alone was used as a comparison with that resulting from the application of precursor and inhibitor in combination.

In a third experiment, eggs in the experimental groups received combined treatments of both reductase and aromatase inhibitor (Table 2). Eggs were incubated at 26-0, 29-0, 29-2, 29-4, or 31 °C and received simultaneously 50 μg CGS16949A and either 50 μg 4MA or 50 μg MK906.

Sex diagnosis
Turtles were killed within two weeks of hatching. Gonadal sex and developmental status of the Müllerian ducts were assessed by examination under a dissection microscope. The gonads of hatching red-eared slider turtles are relatively well differentiated and, with rare exception, appear distinctly testicular or ovarian when viewed under a dissection microscope (Crews et al. 1991, Wibbels et al. 1991a). Ovaries are long and flat whereas testes are shorter, rounder, and have visible seminiferous tubules (see Crews et al. 1991). The developmental status of both the cranial and the caudal halves of the Müllerian ducts were examined and scored as either absent, regressed but visible, normal (as in a typical female hatchling), or hypertrophied. A phallus was also noted if present. The gonads of three to five individuals from each experimental group were processed for histological examination of the gonad to confirm sex assignment. In all instances the histological assessment of sex coincided with the macroscopic assignment of sex.

Statistical analysis
In the first series of experiments, the effects of each dose of different enzyme inhibitor was evaluated versus control using Fisher's Exact test (two-tailed). To determine effect of incubation temperature on sensitivity to the different enzyme inhibitors, inhibitors were examined for effect within each incubation temperature using Pearson Chi-square for difference between doses and Fisher's Exact test for low dose of inhibitor versus control. In the second series of experiments focusing on the combination of testosterone and enzyme inhibitor, the effect of testosterone or enzyme inhibitor alone compared to control was evaluated using Fisher's Exact test (two-tailed). Combination treatments were compared to ethanol control, testosterone alone, or enzyme inhibitor alone using Fisher's Exact test (two-tailed). The third series of experiments examining the effects of combined doses of enzyme inhibitors was evaluated within each incubation temperature using Fisher's Exact test (two-tailed).

To determine the interaction of incubation temperature and experimental treatment, the hatching sex ratio obtained at the different incubation temperatures for the varying doses of inhibitor was compared to that obtained with the ethanol control at that temperature, as in Wibbels et al. (1991b) with slight modifications. Here, the significance of synergism was calculated as follows. First, maximum-likelihood estimates of the following
probabilities were calculated, under the assumption that synergism did not exist: that of producing one sex at a baseline temperature, that of producing one sex at the second temperature, that of producing one sex at the baseline temperature in the presence of the compound, that of producing one sex at the second temperature in the presence of the compound, and finally, the probability that the increases in the proportion of one sex were due to the compound and temperature increment (measured at the baseline temperature) respectively (Wibbels et al. 1991b). These estimates were then used to calculate expected sex ratios for each of the four treatments (temperature × inhibitor), again under the hypothesis that synergism did not exist. A trial consisting of simulated samples was then generated as follows: (a) \(n_j\) uniform, random variables were chosen, where \(n_j\) was the total number of males plus females obtained in the experiment for treatment \(i\), and (b) the simulated number of females in treatment \(i\) was calculated as the number of the \(n_j\) random variables whose value was less than the sex ratio expected for treatment \(i\) under the null hypothesis (the number of males was \(n_j\) minus the number of females). When numbers of males and females had been simulated for all four treatments, a synergism value was calculated for the trial. Ten thousand simulated synergisms were calculated, and the significance of the synergism in the actual data was taken as the proportion of these random samples in which the synergism equalled or was more extreme than the synergism in the data.

Results

Ethanol (control) treatment had no significant effect on the hatchling sex ratio as previously established for the red-eared slider turtle (Wibbels et al. 1991a); an incubation temperature of 26 °C produced all males (male:female sex ratio=100:0), 31 °C produced all females (sex ratio=0:100), whereas 29 °C produced a 88:12 sex ratio, 29.2 °C produced a 65:35 sex ratio, and 29.4 °C produced a 24:76 sex ratio.

The first experiment focused on the effects of enzyme inhibitors at incubation temperatures that yielded different sex ratios. Administration of the reductase inhibitors 4MA (Fig. 1a) or MK906 (Fig. 1b) to eggs incubating at 26 °C, an incubation temperature that produces only males, failed to reverse gonadal sex (4MA, \(P=0.005\); MK906, \(P=0.007\)). Female hatchlings did result at 29 °C, an incubation temperature that produces approximately 90% male development (4MA, \(P<0.0001\); MK906, \(P<0.0001\)) as well as at 29.2 °C, an incubation temperature that results in 65% male development (4MA, \(P<0.001\); MK906, \(P<0.002\)). Differences were not statistically significant at 29.4 °C, an incubation temperature that results in a female-biased sex ratio (24% male) (4MA, \(P=0.746\); MK906, \(P=0.714\)). At the 31 °C incubation temperature, which produces normally only females, all hatchlings were diagnosed as female. There was no evidence of a dose-response relationship with the different doses of 4MA or MK906 at any incubation temperature (4MA: 26 °C, \(P=0.143\); 29 °C, \(P=0.381\); 29.2 °C, \(P=0.853\); 29.4 °C, \(P=0.283\). MK906: 26 °C, \(P=0.124\); 29 °C, \(P=0.534\); 29.2 °C, \(P=0.226\); 29.4 °C, \(P=0.509\)). The effect of the reductase inhibitor compared to that of the ethanol control was not temperature-sensitive; that is, the medium dosage of either 4MA or MK906 did not produce greater numbers of females at more female-producing incubation temperatures (1 μg vs. 10 μg 4MA: 29-0 °C vs. 29.2 °C,
CGS20267 at 100 μg (P=0.239). Intersex gonads were occasionally observed (1–2 individuals in the hatchlings treated with CGS20267 from the 29–0, 29–2 and 29–4 °C incubation temperatures). There was evidence of a dose-response relationship with the different doses of CGS16949A (29–2 °C, P=0.0001; 29–4 °C, P=0.0001) and CGS20267 (29–2 °C, P=0.0001; 29–4 °C, P=0.0001) at the intermediate incubation temperatures. The effect of both aromatase inhibitors was temperature-sensitive; that is, the medium dose compared to the ethanol control produced greater numbers of males at more male-producing incubation temperatures (1 μg vs. 10 μg CGS16949A, 29–4 °C vs. 29–2 °C, P=0.028; 1 μg vs. 10 μg CGS20267, 29–4 °C vs. 29–2 °C, P=0.064).

The second experiment utilized combinations of precursor (testosterone) and enzyme inhibitor. Since statistically significant differences were obtained only in the 26 °C and the 29 °C groups, only these are represented graphically (Fig. 3). The effect of testosterone alone was temperature-sensitive (Pearson Chi-square test within dosage: temperature × sex, P=0.005 for 100 μg and P=0.0001 for 50 μg). At incubation temperatures of 26–0 °C and 29 °C (Fig. 3b), the number of females resulting from administration of either 50 or 100 μg testosterone was significantly greater than control (P=0.0001 for both); the sex ratio produced at 29 °C compared to 26 °C (Fig. 3a) was statistically significant at the 50 μg dose (P=0.0001) but not at the 100 μg dose (P=0.088). At 29–2 °C, both doses were significantly different from control (P=0.0001 for both). At 29–4 °C, the effects of treatment with 50 μg and 100 μg testosterone were not statistically different from control (P=0.470 and P=0.505 respectively). At 31 °C all hatchlings were female in both testosterone treatment and ethanol (temperature) control groups. However, it is perhaps significant that intersex gonads were observed only at the 29–4 °C incubation temperature in the testosterone treatment groups. Such cases were rare (1–2 individuals) except at the 100 μg dose, where there were eight intersex individuals, seven males and 13 females; many of the intersex individuals having large phallics.

As shown in the first experiment, administration of either reductase inhibitor alone was without effect at 26 °C (P(4MA)=0.405; P(MK906)=0.497), but both were effective compared to control at 29 °C (P(4MA)=0.0001; P(MK906)=0.0001). Administration of combined treatments of testosterone and reductase inhibitor (both 4MA and MK906) to eggs incubating at 26 °C resulted in a significant number of females compared to control (P(4MA)=0.0001; P(MK906)=0.0001), but this was not significantly different from that of testosterone alone (P(4MA)=1.0; P(MK906)=0.160).

The complementary experiment evaluated the effects of aromatase inhibitor. Since statistically significant differences were obtained only in the 29–4 °C and the 31 °C groups, only these are represented graphically.

---

**Figure 2.** Administration of aromatase inhibitor induces male development in the red-eared slider (Trachemys scripta). (a) results with CGS16949A; (b) results with CGS20267. Eggs were treated with ethanol (control) or different doses of the inhibitor at each incubation temperature. Sample sizes are given in the text. Comparisons are made within each incubation temperature relative to control; values without the same letter are significantly different at a level of at least P<0.05.

P=0.241; 1 μg vs. 10 μg MK906: 29–0 °C vs. 29–2 °C, P=0.260).

Administration of the aromatase inhibitors CGS16949A (Fig. 2a) or CGS20267 (Fig. 2b) to eggs incubating at 31 °C, an incubation temperature that produces only females, resulted in male hatchlings (CGS16949A at 100 μg, P<0.002; CGS20267 at 100 μg, P<0.004). At the 26 °C incubation temperature, which produces normally only males, all hatchlings were diagnosed as male. Differences were statistically significant at 29–4 °C (CGS16949A at 100 μg, P<0.0001; CGS20267 at 100 μg, P<0.0001) and at 29–2 °C (CGS16949A at 100 μg, P=0.002; CGS20267 at 100 μg, P<0.002), but not statistically significant at 29 °C (CGS16949A at 100 μg P=0.098;
(Fig. 4). There was no statistical difference in the sex ratio produced between the ethanol control group and the testosterone alone group at an incubation temperature of 29.4 °C (Fig. 4a) or 31 °C (Fig. 4b) at either the 10 or 100 μg dose (29.4 °C: $P=0.713$ and 0.505, respectively; 31 °C: $P=1.0$ for both doses); administration of 10 μg at 26 °C also had no effect on the hatching sex ratio compared to control ($P=0.490$). However, administration of 100 μg at 26 °C did produce a significant number of female hatchlings ($P=0.0001$). This was also true for both doses at 29 °C and 29.2 °C ($P=0.0001$ for all groups).

As shown in the first experiment, administration of either aromatase inhibitor alone was without effect at 26.0 and 29 °C; the highest dose (100 μg) resulted in a significantly more male-biased sex ratio than control groups at
29·2, 29·4, and 31 °C (for all temperatures CGS16949A: \( P=0.0001; \) CGS20267: \( P=0.0001). \) Only at 29·4 and 31 °C did combined treatments show an effect over the testosterone and ethanol controls (\( P=0.05-0.0001 \) as illustrated in Fig. 4). Administration of combined treatments of testosterone and aromatase inhibitor to eggs incubating at 29·4 °C and 31 °C resulted in 100% of the hatchlings being male; there was no significant difference between doses (29·4 °C, \( P=1·0; \) 31 °C, \( P=0.678 \)) or temperature (\( P(\text{CGS16949A})=0.115; \) \( P(\text{CGS20267})=0.497 \)) for combined treatments.

The third experiment focused on the effects of simultaneous administration of reductase and aromatase inhibitor (Fig. 5). At all incubation temperatures, with the exception of 31 °C, experimentally-treated animals were mostly or all male; at 29·2 °C and 29·4 °C this was significantly different from the ethanol-treated controls (29·2 °C: 4MA plus CGS16949A, \( P=0.001; \) MK906 plus CGS16949A, \( P=0.001; \) 29·4 °C: 4MA plus CGS16949A, \( P=0.0001; \) MK906 plus CGS16949A, \( P=0.0001). \) At a 31 °C incubation temperature all offspring were female except for the few males obtained from the 4MA plus CGS16949A treatment group.

**Discussion**

Steroid hormone-induced sex determination occurs in fish (Hunter & Donaldson 1983), amphibians (Burns 1961) and reptiles (Crews et al. 1994, Pieau et al. 1994). In birds, administration of exogenous steroid hormones to embryos will feminize the gonads, creating an ovoestis in genetic males but this does not usually persist into adulthood (Scheib 1983). In metatherian mammals administration of exogenous oestrogen will sex-reverse embryos (reviewed by Burns 1961), but in eutherian mammals such treatment has no apparent effect on genetic males, indicating that in these mammals testicular differentiation is not influenced by steroid hormones (see George & Wilson 1994 for review). However, there is evidence of a vestigial sensitivity to steroid hormones in fetal ovarian development. For example, transplanted primordial gonadal tissue from genetic female mice placed under the kidney capsules of adult males will develop into ovoestes (Taketo et al. 1984, see also George & Wilson 1994 for review). Finally, recent studies with both mammalian and avian embryos suggest that genes or gene products such as the testis determining factor at the sex-determining region of the Y chromosome or Müllerian inhibiting substance (MIS) can affect the cytochrome P450 aromatase system and indirectly influence sex determination (Vigier et al. 1989, Haqq et al. 1993).

Steroid hormones are not gene products, so if steroids are important in TSD as has been suggested (Crews et al. 1989, 1991, Dorizzi et al. 1991, Pieau et al. 1994), the mechanism of action might involve differential response to temperature of steroid-converting enzymes, which are gene products. Because testosterone serves as the precursor to both DHT and OE₂ via the actions of the enzymes reductase and aromatase respectively, it is attractive to suggest that temperature acts by modifying the metabolism of testosterone. Previous studies have demonstrated the role of the cytochrome P450 aromatase in female sex determination in the European pond turtle (Dorizzi et al. 1991). The present study with the red-eared slider turtle is the first to suggest that reductase enzymes may be similarly involved in male sex determination. At an incubation temperature that normally produces only male offspring, we found that reductase inhibitors were without discernible effects on the hatching sex ratio. This is an indication the reductase inhibitors are not acting through ERs, since OE₂ administration at 26 °C does lead to female determination. However, at intermediate male-biased incubation temperatures, administration of reductase inhibitor to incubating eggs prevented male development and resulted in significant numbers of female hatchlings. In experiment one, MK906 had a negligible feminizing effect, whereas 4MA had no apparent effect at 26 °C (Fig. 1). In experiment two the opposite pattern was shown, with 4MA having a slightly feminizing effect at 26 °C, whereas MK906 had none. This apparent discrepancy may be attributed to individual differences in sensitivity to these chemicals. Finally, combined administration of testosterone and reductase inhibitor to eggs incubating at a male-producing temperature also resulted in the
production of female hatchlings. These findings support the hypothesis of the role of reductase enzymes in male sex determination. When considered with the previous finding that exogenous DHT will induce male development when administered to eggs incubating at a threshold temperature – the temperature that yields a 50:50 sex ratio (Wibbels & Crews 1993) – the present results suggest that male development may be mediated by an androgen receptor (AR).

Previous experiments have demonstrated that the aromatase inhibitor CGS16949A will interfere with temperature-induced female sex determination in the alligator (Lance & Bogart 1992) and the red-eared slider turtle (Wibbels & Crews 1994). The present study indicates that the aromatase inhibitor CGS20267 will also cause male development if administered at either intermediate or all female-producing incubation temperatures. In mammalian systems CGS20267 is more potent than CGS16949A, but there was no difference detected in the hatchling sex ratios in the gonads for the effective doses in the present study. Similarly, administration of CGS16949A during early development causes genetic female chickens to develop as gonadal males. Interestingly, another aromatase inhibitor, 1,4,6-androstatrien-3,17-dione (ATD), is not effective in this regard (Elbrecht & Smith 1992; see also Wartenberg et al. 1992). As in the chicken, neither ATD nor 4-androsten-4-ol-3,17-dione are effective in reversing temperature-induced female sexual development in the red-eared slider (Wibbels & Crews 1992) or alligator (Lance & Bogart 1992). The fact that aromatase inhibitors produce more males at 29-4 °C compared to 31 °C is indirect evidence that aromatase production is temperature-sensitive, with more aromatase being produced at more female-biased temperatures. Interestingly, a similar synergism does not appear to occur with temperature and either reductase inhibitor.

In the present study administration of testosterone to eggs incubating at male-biased intermediate temperatures produced females in a dose- and temperature-dependent manner. This effect was blocked by administration of testosterone and aromatase inhibitor. It is perhaps significant that treatment of eggs incubating at a female-biased intermediate temperature with a high dose of testosterone resulted in a significant number of intersexes, a finding similar to that of the increased number of intersexes produced upon administration of both DHT and O2 (Wibbels & Crews 1993). This is a further indication that an excess of precursor (testosterone) may lead to simultaneous activation of the ovary- and testis-determining cascades. Finally, the observation that the combined application of testosterone and aromatase inhibitor produced males at all female-producing incubation temperature as well as at a female-biased intermediate incubation temperature compared to administration of either compound alone supports the hypothesis that (i) there is a testis-determining cascade independent of an ovary-determining cascade, and (ii) the metabolism of testosterone to O2 via aromatization is critical to female sex determination; that is, blocking aromatase activity and providing excess precursor testosterone results in the production of males, presumably through the metabolism of testosterone to DHT via reductase. Again, the significant increase in the number of males produced with testosterone and aromatase inhibitor compared to aromatase inhibitor alone indicates that the aromatase inhibitor is not acting through an AR.

Combined treatment with both aromatase inhibitor and reductase inhibitor resulted in male development, suggesting that aromatase inhibitor is more potent than reductase inhibitor. Alternatively, testosterone may not be metabolized to DHT or to O2 and could act through ARs which may be mediating male sexual development. Finally, the fact that administration of both reductase and aromatase inhibitors simultaneously to eggs incubating at 31 °C resulted in only (4MA) or mostly (MK9006) female hatchlings suggests a nonsteroidal temperature effect, perhaps a temperature-induced upregulation of steroid receptor.

How then might temperature be acting to determine sex in the red-eared slider turtle? In reptiles with TSD it would appear that female and male sex determination are separate processes that are differentially affected by incubation temperature rather than the organization/default system characteristic of genotypic sex determination (Jost 1961). Thus, females may result from the activation of an ovary-determining cascade and inhibition of a testis-determining cascade; conversely, males may result from the activation of a testis-determining cascade and inhibition of an ovary-determining cascade. Central to the steroid hormone-mediation hypothesis (Crews et al. 1989, 1991, Dorizzi et al. 1991, Pieau et al. 1994) is the role of testosterone as a precursor molecule destined for conversion to DHT (via reductase) or O2 (via aromatase). One hypothetical model postulates that at a female-producing temperature the gene(s) encoding for aromatase are activated and the gene(s) encoding for reductase remain at constitutive levels (or perhaps suppressed via negative feedback control of O2), resulting in increased O2 production. For example, Claude Pieau and colleagues (reviewed by Pieau et al. 1994) have documented a positive feedback relationship between O2 secretion and aromatase production at a female-producing temperature in the European pond turtle. On the other hand, at a male-producing temperature the gene(s) encoding for reductase may be enhanced and the gene(s) encoding for aromatase inhibited, resulting in increased DHT production. As yet unproven, a positive feedback relationship similar to that between aromatase and O2 may exist between DHT and reductase. An alternative model to account for the finding of a lack of a dose-response in the effect of the reductase inhibitor, as well as the absence
of a synergism between DHT sensitivity and incubation temperature as occurs between OE2 sensitivity and incubation temperature, indicates that the gene(s) for reductase are constitutively expressed at the various incubation temperatures. Thus, incubation temperature would act only indirectly via the testis-determining gene(s), having a negative feedback on the regulation of aromatase gene expression, leading to suppression of OE2. For example, Haqq et al. (1993) demonstrated recently in the rat that the putative male-determining factor (SRY) may control male development through regulation of aromatase and MIS genes. In both models incubation temperature would modulate the activity of at least four distinct genes; the genes encoding for aromatase, ERs, reductase and ARs. Further details of this model are provided by Crews (1994).

We propose further that incubation temperature activates the gene(s) encoding for steroid hormone receptors (e.g., male-producing temperature upregulating ARs and female-producing temperature upregulating ERs). Whatever the actual enzymatic regulation, the resulting hormonal milieu would lead to the binding of DHT and OE2 to specific, high-affinity, intranuclear receptor proteins (AR and ER, respectively), which in turn would activate the putative receptors such that the hormone-hormone receptor complex would bind to hormone response elements on the DNA. The consequence of such events would be a stimulation of the transcription of genes associated with the sex-determining cascade of one sex and an inhibition of the expression of genes associated with the sex-determining cascade of the opposite sex.

Such a model would account for the following facts. (i) The effect of temperature or exogenous steroids is all-or-none; that is, individuals are either male or female. (ii) Incubation at a threshold temperature results in a 50:50 sex ratio, rather than intersexes being formed. (iii) Intersexes can be formed experimentally by the simultaneous administration of DHT and OE2 to eggs incubating at a threshold incubation temperature or by high doses of testosterone at female-biased incubation temperatures. (iv) Exogenous OE2 will overcome the effects of male-producing temperatures, and there is a correlation between oestrogen-sensitivity and temperature-sensitivity. (v) Exogenous DHT cannot overcome the effects of a female-producing temperature; although exogenous DHT will induce male development in eggs incubating at a threshold incubation temperature, there is no apparent synergism between incubation temperature and sensitivity to DHT. (vi) Steroid-induced gonadal feminization is specific to ER-responsive oestrogens whereas gonadal masculinization appears to be specific to AR-responsive androgens. (vii) Administration of an aromatase inhibitor will block female development and induce male development, whereas administration of a reductase inhibitor will block male development and induce female development, in eggs incubating at intermediate incubation temperatures.

Acknowledgements

We would like to acknowledge the technical assistance of Anthony Alexander, Cristin Fitzpatrick, Huy Nguyen, and Healy Smith. Thane Wibbels provided comments on the manuscript and James J Bull assisted with the statistics of synergism. The 4MA and MK906 were courtesy of David Russell and Jean Wilson of the Southwestern Medical School; the CGS16949A and 20267 were courtesy of Ciba-Geigy. This research was supported by NSF IBN-9205207; DC was supported by NIMH Research Scientist Award 00135 and JMB by a NSF Predoctoral Fellowship.

References


Jost A 1961 The role of fetal hormones in prenatal development. Harvey Lectures 55 201–226.

Lance VA & Bogart MH 1991 Tamoxifen sex reverses alligator embryos at male producing temperatures, but is an antioestrogen in female hatchlings. Experientia 47 263–266.


Received 18 March 1994
Accepted 22 June 1994