

## Meeting of the Scripts Institute

### Minutes for

Friday, February 20, 2015

**Attendants:** Tom Palaima, Kevin Pluta, Joann Gulizio, JoAnn Hackett, Jamie Aprile, Adam Rabinowitz, Will Bibee, Aren Wilson-Wright, Sigrid Kjaer, Sarah Buchanan, David Sobey, Deborah Bibee, and John Bibee.

The meeting commenced at 1:00 pm.

The meeting began with a few general announcements. First, Kevin Pluta reminded members to send him a bio and an updated CV for the website, if they have not already done so. Kevin also noted that if members send him pdfs of their articles and/or publications, he could provide links to these documents directly from their CV page. Lastly, Kevin requested from those who have presented their research to the Institute this past year to send him a short abstract of their talk.

It was decided that for our next Scripts Institute meeting Jo Ann Hackett will present her research on an inscription that mentions YAHWEH with the term Asherah, which could either refer to the consort of YAHWEH or a term meaning “pole”.

Tom Palaima introduced Will Bibee, noting his early research on the Akkadian term *qatarū* and its relationship to the Greek word καθαρός. He acknowledged that Will’s extensive knowledge in both Mycenaean Greek/Linear B and Near Eastern languages is quite impressive, and that Will is one of the few scholars to demonstrate real authority in both areas. He mentioned Will’s dissertation work on Near Eastern scribes and his research interests involving explaining problematic terms in Linear B using his knowledge of Near Eastern languages.

Will began his discussion by first providing additional details on his work with *qatarū* and καθαρός. He explained that *qatarū* is Akkadian meaning “to fumigate” and is Indo-European in origin, whereas καθαρός is Ancient Greek meaning “clean, unsoiled.” The scholar Walter Burkert in *The Orientalizing Revolution* was the first to note a relation between *qatarū* and καθαρός. Will demonstrated that the Greek term καθαρός comes from the Akkadian *qatarū*. He explained that in the Akkadian term, the consonants -q- and -t- are emphatics. In Greek, when Indo-European words have two consecutive emphatics, one emphatic is dissimilated and becomes an aspirate in the Ancient Greek language. Will proposed that such a dissimilation occurred with *qatarū* and καθαρός; that is, the -t- consonant in the Akkadian term becomes aspirated to θ in Greek. The same dissimilation can be seen in the Greek χιτών. Also interesting is the early uses of the term καθαρός, particularly in the Homer’s *Odyssey*, all of which seem to imply some type of fumigation process involving incense burning and pouring ritual libations. Will noted that purifications of this sort are typical of Near Eastern rituals, but not Greek. He concluded that the term *qatarū* has to be Akkadian and pre-Homeric. Lastly, his research addressed the question: “When did the Akkadians come into contact with the Mycenaeans?,” the answer to which likely lies in the term *Aḫḫiyawa*, mentioned in Hittite letters between kings in the region. This term seem to refer to the Greek-speaking Mycenaeans and is similar to the Homeric term Achaeans.

Will then turned to another problematic Linear B term, *a-ke-a<sup>2</sup>*, found on a tablet from Pylos (PY Vn 130). He was first alerted to the term when Tom was studying this tablet in preparation for his contribution to Cynthia Shelmerdine’s festschrift. Tom proposed that Vn 130 had long been misinterpreted and his paper demonstrated this tablet’s connection to other tablets associated with the production of perfumed oil. The term *a-ke-a<sup>2</sup>* (equivalent to *a-ke-ha*) can be understood as */angeha/* or in Ancient Greek ἄγγεα, meaning “vessels.” The term for vessels used in Homer is ἄγγεσιν. Some

examples include: (1) *Od.* 2.228-291 where the term seems to refer to a large vase with handles; (2) *Odyssey* 16.13 where wine placed in an ἄγγος, suggesting a type of krater; (3) *Odyssey* 9.222 where the Cyclops puts milk in such a vessel; and (4) *Il.* 2.471, where an ἄγγεα is described as “drenched with milk.” On Vn 130, various individuals at specific locales are listed as recipients of *a-ke-a*<sup>2</sup>. For example, on line .3, an individual named *e-ru-si-jo* at a place called *a-pi-no-e-wi-jo* receives a single quantity of *a-ke-a*<sup>2</sup>. Many of the individuals listed on this tablet are described as bronzesmiths on other Linear B tablets.

Another problem with understanding this tablet is the term *o-ze-to*. Both Tom and Will believe that Palmer’s original linguistic interpretation of this term as γέντο (3<sup>rd</sup> person singular aorist meaning “he took, grasped, seized, is in store”) must be incorrect. Unfortunately, this understanding of *o-ze-to* was so widely accepted that Cynthia Shelmerdine did not include a discussion of Vn 130 in her seminal work on the Mycenaean perfumed oil industry. Tom, however, recognized a connection between *o-ze-to* on Vn 130 and the Linear B term *ze-so-me-no*, a participial form derived from the Greek verb ζέω meaning “to boil” which is attested on one of perfumed oil tablets (PY Un 267). The initial -o- in the Linear B term *o-ze-to* is functioning as an introductory particle, similar to the Ancient Greek term δέ, which is used frequently after μέν; together μέν ... δέ are understood as “on the one hand ... on the other hand.” This initial o-element (sometimes written as jo-) is attested on several other Linear B tablets. The use of this initial -o- in *o-ze-to*, therefore, implies that this tablet should be understood alongside of or in conjunction with another tablet.

Will then turned to another problematic term on Vn 130, *ai-to-pi* (sometimes written \*34-to-pi). First, the sign \*34 (and a similar sign \*35) are not the typical signs used to represent the phoneme -ai-, which is usually rendered with the sign a<sub>3</sub>. Linguistically, Will believes that *ai-to-pi* should be understood as αἶθο(σ)φι and is related to the Ancient Greek terms αἶθηρ and αἶθω (“to burn”). These terms are linguistically related to the Sanskrit *edha*, meaning “firewood.” Therefore, *ai-to-pi* on Vn 130 is an instrumental dative referring to “burn logs” or “firewood.” With this understanding of the terms, the first lines of Vn 130 should be translated as “Thus, Kessadoros boiled vessels with firewood.”

Jo Ann Hackett asked why they would be boiling vessels. Tom explained that it was not the vessels that were being boiled, but these vessels were likely used to boil perfumed oil which was an essential industry for the Mycenaeans (as the Linear B tablets demonstrate). Rabinowitz noted that in Ancient Greek the term ἄγγος always referred to vessels made out of clay. He asked why we think that here they would be made of bronze. Will explained that on Vn 130 many of the individuals listed are also described as bronzesmiths on other Linear B tablets. In addition, Near Eastern parallels suggest the use of bronze and/or stone vessels in perfume manufacture. As Shelmerdine notes in her study on the perfumed oil industry at Pylos, Middle Assyrian perfume texts describe the production of perfumed oil and it seems that their method finds the closest parallel to those used at Pylos (as opposed to methods described and used in later Greek literature). Lastly, Will noted that he and Joann Gulizio researched the small finds from the Palace of Nestor at Pylos, especially the rooms where the perfumed oil tablets were recovered, and noted a bronze handle was found in the wine magazine, which could have belonged to such an ἄγγος.

The meeting adjourned at 2:00 pm.

Minutes were taken by Joann Gulizio.

## Linear B *a-ke-a<sub>2</sub>* = Akkadian *agannu* : Connections Between Ahḫiyawa and Assyria

### 0. Introduction: Pylos Vn 130 and Its Interpretation (See Slides)

Text:

.1	o-ze-to , ke-sa-do-ro , ai-to-pi ,	
.2a	pa-ro	
.2b	a-ke-a <sub>2</sub> , me-ta-pa , pe-ri-te	1
.3	a-pi-no-e-wi-jo , pa-ro , e-ru-si-jo	1
.4	a-pi-no-e-wi-jo , pa-ro , a <sub>3</sub> -ki-e-we	4
.5	e-na-po-ro , pa-ro , wa-do-me-no	9
.6	sa-ri-no-te , pa-ro , o-wo-to	5
.7	pa-ki-ja-si , pa-ro , a-ta-no-re	4
.8	ka-ra-do-ro , pa-ro , to-ro-wo	1
.9	pa-ki-ja-si , pa-ro , e-ri-we-ro	3
.10	e-wi-te-wi-jo , pa-ro – wi-sa-to	1
.11	]ME-te-to , pa-ro , ko-do	3
.12	ro-]u-so	24
.13	]me-te-to , pa-ro , e-u-qo-ne	3

#### **ESSENTIAL FOR INTERNAL UNDERSTANDING OF *a-ke-a<sub>2</sub>*:**

- i) Nature of individuals involved
- ii) Interpretation of *o-ze-to*
- iii) Meaning of *ai-to-pi*
- iv) Most likely interpretation of *a-ke-a<sub>2</sub>* in light of Homer

## 1.0 Basic Interpretation of the text:

1.1 The individuals involved seem to be bronze smiths—see PowerPoint.

1.2 ***o-ze-to***: “Thus Kessandros boiled/is boiling...” The ambiguity of verb tense is due to the ambiguity of the spelling in Linear B. The *o-* element is a common introductory particle found in many texts (also in the form *jo-*): Py Eq 213, Pn 30, Ta 711, Un 267, Vn 10, Wa 917 (Palaima 2014: 84).

Ancient Greek: ζέω, “to boil,” leads to two options

- 1) Present tense: ὡς ζηστοι Κεσσανδρος (?)... “So boils Kessandros (?)...”
- 2) Aorist tense (without augment): ὡς ζητο Κεσσανδρος... “Thus boiled Kessandros...”

1.3 ***ai-to-pi***: Most likely a word for “burn log(s),” related to later Greek αἶθος, “burning heat, fire” (*LSJ*), in the instrumental plural αἶθο(σ)φι (?). The Indo-European cognate terms include Sanskrit *édha-*, meaning “firewood,” from a Proto-Indo-European *\*h<sub>2</sub>eid<sup>h</sup>-os*. The basic form of the root is found in the n-stem Sanskrit verb *indh-*, “to burn” (with an *n*-infix in the verb PIE verb *\*h<sub>2</sub>i-n-d<sup>h</sup>-* “to burn”). See Beekes 2010, pp. 36-37, for more linguistic data.

1.4 ***a-ke-a<sub>2</sub>*** - /*angeha*/: Plural of Homeric sg. ἄγγοϝ: ἄγγεα, a third-declension noun, is the obvious alphabetic continuation of this term. The form in the Mycenaean text is an early accusative plural with the aspiration in the suffixed noted by [*a<sub>2</sub>*] = /*ha*/. Also, the double gamma in Greek was pronounced /*ng*/. See uses in Homer: *Il.* 2.471, 16.643; *Od.* 2.289 (storage on ship), 9.222, 248 (milk 2x), 16.13 (wine)

There are other interpretations in the literature, but for reasons of time, we will not be going into them today.

**Summary of KEY POINTS:** Vn 130 describes boiling of bronze vessels with “fire logs” or “firewood.” The most likely context for this is the manufacture of aromatics that were then exported around the Mediterranean and even into northern Syria. (**ISSUE FOR DISCUSSION: How many stirrup jars made it to Mesopotamia?**)

## **2.0 How to connect the Aegean and Mesopotamia:**

- Show the likelihood of interaction
- Demonstrate the use of Akkadian *agannu* in contexts similar to those found in Vn 130
- Demonstrate the linguistic loan phonetically

### **2.1 The Relationship Between the Aegean and Near East**

- Edith Porada argued from the lapis lazuli cylinder seal hoard from Aegean Thebes for a Kassite Babylonian embassy to the Aegean in the Late Bronze Age. See Porada 1981-1982 for extensive argument.
- In the Aḫḫiyawa correspondence, the Hittite king, Tudhaliya IV (1237-1209 BCE), writes to Šaušgamuwa of Amurru, asking him to prevent trade between his enemy, Assyria, and Aḫḫiyawa (most likely the Aegean realm). See Beckman et al. 2011, pp. 50-69, esp. 60-63, for specific passages.
- The Aḫḫiyawa demonstrate the monarch of Aḫḫiyawa, although often unidentified by name, was part of the “Brotherhood of Kings,” which included the royalty of Egypt, Assyria, Babylonia, Mitanni, and Hatti. See Beckman et al. 2011 for extensive discussion

### **2.2 The uses of Akkadian *agannu* in Middle Assyrian texts indicate that it was a vessel involved in perfume manufacture.**

See slides for details!

### **2.3 The phonetic likelihood of the loan!**

- See Southern and Vaughn 1997 for extensive discussion of nasalization in Semitic consonant clusters.
- See Mayer 1971, pp. 23-24 for the example of nasalization of a geminated *gg* in Middle Assyrian: *im-ma-an-ga-ar* “er eklärt sich einverstanden.” ***This would normally be written without an -ag- instead of an -an-.***

### **3.0 Conclusion:**

***One can make a reasonable argument for Middle Assyrian influence of Pylian perfume techniques using linguistic, technological, archaeological and literary evidence. The idea that there was direct contact between the Aegean and Near Eastern polities should be taken more seriously than heretofore. The frequent minimalist explanation of interaction through a “middleman” of Cypriot or Syro-Palestinian influence should be re-examined.***

**Thanks to John Huehnergard, Tom Palaima, Joann Gulizio, Kevin Pluta, Aren Wilson-Wright, Deborah Bibee, Grant McInnes, and Michael Vaclav for listening me talk about this *ad nauseam*. I especially thank John for reading a paper version of this and offering his usual insightful—and gracious—analysis.**

## **Bibliography:**

Anderson, Deborah. 1994-1995. "Mycenaean Vessel Terms: Evaluating the IE Evidence," *Minos* 29-30, pp. 295-322.

eds. Aruz, Joan, Kim Benzel, and Jean M. Evans. 2009. *Beyond Babylon: Art, Trade, and Diplomacy in the Second Millennium B.C.* The Metropolitan Museum of Art: New York and Yale University Press: New Haven and London.

Beckman, Gary M., Trevor R. Bryce, and Eric H. Cline. 2011. *The Ahhiyawa Texts*. Society of Biblical Literature – Writings from the Ancient World 28. Society of Biblical Literature: Atlanta.

Beekes, Robert Stephen Paul. 2010. *Etymological Dictionary of Greek*. With the Assistance of Lucien van Beek. 2 Vols. Brill: Leiden.

Bourguignon, Alexandra. 2012. *Les emprunts sémantiques en grec ancien: Étude méthodologique et exemples mycéniens*. Ph.D. Université Libre de Bruxelles, Faculté de Philosophie et Lettres.

ed. Davis, Jack L. 1998. *Sandy Pylos: An Archaeological History from Nestor to Navarino*. University of Texas Press: Austin.

Ebeling, Erich. 1950. *Parfümrezepte und kultische Texte aus Assur*. Pontificium Institutum Biblicum, Roma.

Galaty, Michael. 1999 (2007). "Wealth Ceramics, Staple Ceramics: Pots and the Mycenaean Palaces," in eds. Michael Galaty and Michael Parkinson, *Rethinking Mycenaean Palaces: New Interpretations of an Old Idea*, UCLA Monograph 41, Los Angeles, pp. 74-86.

Levey, Martin. 1960. "A Group of Akkadian Texts of Perfumery," *Chymia* 6, pp. 11-19.

Melena, José. 2014. "Filling Gaps in the Linear B Additional Syllabary: The Case of Syllabogram \*34," in eds. A. Martínez Fernández, B. Ortega Villaro, H. Velasco López, H. Zamora Salamanca, *Ἄγαλμα. Homenaje a Manuel García Teijeiro*, Valladolid: Secretariado de Publicaciones e Intercambio Editorial Universidad de Valladolid: Valladolid, pp. 207-226.

Palaima, Thomas. 2014. "Pylos Tablet Vn 130 and the Pylos Perfume Industry," in eds. Nakassis, Dimitri, Joann Gulizio, and Sarah A. James, *KE-RA-ME-JA: Studies Presented to Cynthia W. Shelmerdine*, INSTAP Academic Press, Philadelphia.

Palmer, Leonard. 1963 (1969). *The Interpretation of Mycenaean Greek Texts*, Clarendon Press: Oxford (second and revised edition 1969).

Porada, Edith. 1981-1982. "The Cylinder Seals Found at Thebes in Boeotia," *Archiv für Orientforschung* 28, pp. 1-70.

Risch, Ernst. 1968. "Die mykenischen Einleitungsformeln," in *Atti e Memorie del 1° congresso Internazionale di micenologia, Roma 27 settembre- 3 ottobre 1968*, Vol. 2, Edizioni dell'Ateneo: Roma, pp. 686-698.

Salonen, Armas. 1966. *Die Hausgeräte der alten Mesopotamier nach sumerisch-akkadischen Quellen*, 2 Teile. Teil 2: *Gefässe*. *Annales Academiae Scientiarum Fennicae, Series B*. Vol. 144. Helsinki.

Shelmerdine, Cynthia. 1985. *The Perfume Industry of Mycenaean Pylos*. Paul Åströms Förlag: Göteborg.

Southern, Mark and Andrew G. Vaughn. 1997. "Where Have all the Nasals Gone? *nC* > *CC* in North Semitic\*," in *Journal of Semitic Studies* 42.2, pp. 263-282.